



HON. SYLVIA O. HINDS-RADIX  
Corporation Counsel

THE CITY OF NEW YORK  
**LAW DEPARTMENT**

100 CHURCH STREET  
NEW YORK, NY 10007

NICOLETTE PELLEGRINO  
Senior Counsel  
Phone: (212) 356-2338  
Fax: (212) 356-3509  
Email: npellegr@law.nyc.gov

March 1, 2024

VIA E.C.F.

Honorable Arun Subramanian  
United States District Judge  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl Street  
New York, New York 10007

Application granted. The Clerk of Court is directed to seal Dkt. 205 so that neither Plaintiff nor anyone besides defense counsel can access it.

SO ORDERED.

Arun Subramanian, U.S.D.J.

Date: March 1, 2024

RE: Christopher Hiram Cano v. City of New York, et al.,  
19 Civ. 1640 (AS)

Your Honor:

I am Senior Counsel in the Special Federal Litigation Division of the New York City Law Department and the attorney representing defendants the City of New York, New York City Health and Hospitals, New York City Department of Correction (“DOC”) Captains Charles and Robinson, and DOC Officers Chisolm and Santiago (collectively, “Defendants”) in the above-referenced matter. Defendants write to respectfully request that the “Marshal’s Process Receipt And Return Of Service Executed” filed yesterday at Docket Number 205 be sealed, precluding Plaintiff or anyone besides defense counsel from accessing it.

By way of relevant background, on July 5, 2023, the Court held, *inter alia*, that by “July 12, 2023, Defendants shall file a letter on ECF with any contact information for Murray that they are able to locate through reasonable diligence, to assist the U.S. Marshals in effectuating service.” (Dkt. No. 178.) The Court further held that “[s]uch letter may be filed under seal **because it contains confidential personal information.**” (*Id.*) (emphasis added).

Indeed, the Court acknowledged that defendant Murray’s personal contact information, including her potential home address, was to remain confidential and was not to be shared with the public or Plaintiff.

Accordingly, on July 5, 2023, the Defendants provided defendant Murray’s potential service address *ex parte* under seal and provided a redacted copy to Plaintiff. (See Dkt. No. 179.)

However, on February 29, 2024, a “Marshal’s Process Receipt And Return Of Service Executed” was filed publicly on the Electronic Docket, detailing what could be former officer’s Murray’s home address. (See Dkt. No. 205.) But, as already acknowledged by the Court and Defendants, such personal information should remain confidential and is not to be publicized on the docket or shared with Plaintiff.

Accordingly, Defendants respectfully request that the “Marshal’s Process Receipt And Return Of Service Executed” filed yesterday at Docket Number 205 be sealed, precluding Plaintiff or anyone besides defense counsel from accessing it.

The Defendants thank the Court for its consideration.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Nicolette Pellegrino  
Nicolette Pellegrino  
Senior Counsel  
Special Federal Litigation Division

CC: VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL  
Christopher Hiram Cano  
B&C No. 8952200296  
11-11 Hazen Street  
East Elmhurst, New York 11370